

**Quebec Student Debating Association**  
**Special General Meeting – Wednesday, September 14, 2005**  
**Lower Canada College**

**1. Welcome/Call to order/Introductions ( at 4:11pm )**

**Present:**

Judy Stein	Bialik
<b>Jeff Itcush</b>	<b>Bialik</b>
Aaron Shachner	Bialik
<b>Mark Olsson</b>	<b>Centennial Academy</b>
Ryan Abrams	Centennial Academy / Marianopolis College
<b>Brandon Uditsky</b>	<b>Herzliah (Snowdon)</b>
<b>Noah Kochman</b>	<b>Herzliah (St. Laurent)</b>
Allan Tabatchnik	Herzliah (St. Laurent)
<b>Louise Chalmers</b>	<b>John Rennie</b>
Chris George	Lower Canada College ( President )
<b>Elizabeth Cohene</b>	<b>Lower Canada College</b>
Denis Brault	Loyola High School
<b>Paul DeStefano</b>	<b>Royal West Academy</b>
Annike Flomen	Royal West Academy
Talia Ralph	Royal West Academy
<b>Tino Bordanaro</b>	<b>Sacred Heart / Proxy for Lindsay Place</b>
<b>Liana Palko</b>	<b>Selwyn House</b>
Erin Russet	Selwyn House
<b>Jeff Deeprise</b>	<b>St. George's</b>
Donna Gold	St. George's
<b>Mary-Kate Jackson</b>	<b>Queen of Angels</b>
<b>Rachel McCabe</b>	<b>Trafalgar ( Treasurer )</b>
<b>Sharen McDonald</b>	<b>Weston School</b>
<b>Sandy Cross</b>	<b>Westwood H.S. ( Vice-President )</b>
<b>James Phelan</b>	<b>McDonald / Concordia / Proxy for MacDonald</b>
Marsha Goulet	English School Board of Montreal ( observer )
Bill Brooks	Kuper Academy ( observer )

**Regrets:**

Judith Schurmann	Chambly Academy
James Rioux	Stanstead College
Isabelle Fahmy	The Study
James Roy	Westwood H.S.
Elana Galchinsky	St. Thomas
Tina Grivas	West Island College
Catherine Grimanis	ECS

**Chair:** Chris George

**Minutes:** Ryan Abrams

**2. Roll Call, Introduce QSDA Executive and all Coaches, Identify Voting members ( 1 per member school )**

Voting members are indicated in bold above.

### 3. QSDA By-Laws

Chris introduces the new by-laws and explains procedure.

- Last year was problematic as old by-laws were dated from 1984 and no rules were added to the document.
- New by-laws to be proposed and amended at this special meeting in order to have a clear governing document for the QSDA.
- Explains procedure of meeting.
- Does not want debate on past rules, wants document to reflect current rules and then members can make additions or changes to the new by-laws.
- 75% majority required to repeal and pass new by-laws.
- Simple majority required to pass motion to amend proposed by-laws.
- Goes through and summarizes items in the by-laws.
- Would like to move towards using AGM in June to deal with by-laws issues, and to pass motions will need a simple majority; other motions throughout the year would need a 2/3 majority.
- Opens the floor to questions.

*No questions at this time.*

**MOTION To repeal all existing by-laws of the QSDA and to adopt the attached document as the new by-laws for the QSDA.**

**Moved: Noah**

**Seconded: Elizabeth**

### **Secondary Motions to amend the proposed by-laws:**

Chris: My proposed motion for awards and Rachel's motion are changes to current rules and should be presented in the general meeting.

**MOTION to add the following to clause 3 "The deadline for membership is January 31<sup>st</sup>".**

**Moved: Rachel**

**Seconded: Noah**

**CARRIED Unanimously.**

- Noah: What is the fee (150\$)
- Deadline for payment and membership would be January 31<sup>st</sup> .

**MOTION to add the following clauses regarding tie breakers:**

- add the following the end of clause #79 to address tiebreakers.  
"Should there be still be a tie after speaker points are considered, then the tie shall be broken, only if necessary, by considering the following criteria in order:
  - a) win-loss record and then speaker points in any prepared rounds only;
  - b) if still tied, wins and then scores in any round(s) in which the teams debated each other; and
  - c) if still tied, a coin toss.

- add two new clause after #82 to address tiebreaker criteria that read as follows:
  1. “Any tie in individual standings shall, only if necessary, be broken by considering the following criteria in order:
    - a) scores in any prepared rounds;
    - b) if still tied, the best score from a single judge, and if still tied, the second-best score from a single judge, and if still tied, so on through the scores; and
    - c) if still tied, a coin toss.
  2. “In a tournament where speaker points are used for team standings, should be there be any ties, then the tie shall be broken, only if necessary, by considering the following criteria in order:
    - a) scores in any prepared rounds;
    - b) if still tied, scores in any round(s) in which the teams debated each other; and
    - c) if still tied, a coin toss.

**Moved: Sandy**  
**Seconded by Mary Kate**  
**CARRIED Unanimously.**

**MOTION to adopt Catherine Grimanis’ amendments as follows:**

- #15. Delete the comma after the word “absent”.
- #40. Change “7”, “8” and “9” to “seven”, “eight” and “nine” respectively and delete the word “as”.
- #48. Change “in a preliminary round of any tournament” to “in preliminary rounds of tournaments”.
- #50. add the word “the” before “awards ceremony”.
- #54 change the word “on” to “to”.
- #66 change the word “and” to “as well as”.
- #70 change “not” to “no”.
- #73. change “and may employ computer software” to “and may be determined by computer software”.
- #83 delete the word “individual”.
- #86 change the word “any” to “all”.

**Moved: Mark**  
**Seconded: Paul**  
**CARRIED 14-0-2.**

**Motion to amend clauses 33 and 35:**

- 33. Change “ member’s “ to “ members’ “
- 35. Eliminate the word “has”.

**Moved: Sharen**

**Seconded: Noah**

**CARRIED Unanimously.**

**MOTION to amend judging criteria as follows:**

After the section on “Briefings” add three new clauses under the heading of “Judging” that says:

1. No one may judge a student that he/she coaches or who is a member of his/her immediate family.
2. Every effort shall be made to ensure that no judge sees the same team more than once.
3. No current high school student may judge a (senior)\* QSDA event.

**Moved: Sharen**

**Seconded: Noah**

Discussion:

*Liana: In the past senior debaters have judged in junior tournaments.*

*Chris: We should make a firm rule and respect it at all events.*

*\*Friendly amendment moved by Liana and seconded by Noah.*

**The MOTION is carried unanimously.**

**MOTION to amend the following regarding preparation and notification for tournaments:**

# 67. Add the following at the end of the clause:

“Any changes to the wording of the prepared resolution of the debate after invitations have been issued must be confirmed with the coaches of member schools prior to the tournament.”

# 90. Add the following at the end of the clause:

“Any changes to the style of the debate after invitations have been issued must be confirmed with the coaches of member schools prior to the tournament.”

**Moved: Sharen**

**Seconded: Noah**

Discussion:

*Sharon: It is necessary to be fair to debaters to give them notification on the above changes and deserve proper notification.*

*Mary Kate: If emails aren't always working, how should we be confirming?*

*Chris: A reply is a good confirmation, if none is received host should re-notify.*

**The motion is CARRIED unanimously.**

**MOTION to add a new clause after # 3 that reads:**

“Schools who are unable to complete the membership procedure due to a labour action shall retain membership until 30 days after the end of the labour action. In addition, the membership deadline for those schools shall also be 30 thirty days after the end of the labour action. There shall be no reduction in fees, unless a labour dispute ends after January 1, in which case schools will have their fee reduced to half, or if a dispute extends past March 1 schools will have their fee waived for the year.”

**Moved: Sandy**

**Seconded: Elizabeth**

*Discussion:*

*Sandy: Public schools are now under an extra-curricular ban due to a labor dispute. Students may not compete at tournaments. This clause ensures that schools that are under this ban do not have to pay for membership.*

**The motion is CARRIED with one opposed.**

Chris opens the floor to debate and/or additional amendments.

**Motion to vote immediately on the primary motion.**

**Moved: Sandy**

**Seconded: Liana**

**CARRIED 12-4-0.**

**MOTION to repeal all existing by-laws of the QSDA and to adopt the attached document as the new by-laws for the QSDA.**

**CARRIED 12-4-0.**

#### **4. Adjournment**

**Motion to adjourn at 4:53 p.m.**

**Moved: Liana**

**Seconded: Denis**

**Carried unanimously.**